

B3: Unpacking Parent Demand and Quality Priorities for Nontraditional Hour Child Care: Fostering Economic and Cultural Equity

Wednesday, June 28, 2023

2:30 p.m. – 3:45 p.m. | *L'Enfant Ballroom ABCD (Livestreamed)*

1. Descriptive Information

<p>B3: Unpacking Parent Demand and Quality Priorities for Nontraditional Hour Child Care: Fostering Economic and Cultural Equity</p> <p>Equitable access to high-quality child care includes responsiveness to families' work schedules and resource needs and children's developmental needs. Significant proportions of families with low incomes work nontraditional hours (NTH), yet the early childhood field has focused almost exclusively on child care provision during daytime hours during the workweek, with limited attention paid to quality, supply, and workforce experiences during NTH. Understanding NTH child care is an equity issue, given that NTH care is both provided and used disproportionately by low-income populations of color.</p> <p>This session focuses on families' needs for NTH child care from the demand and quality perspectives. We will explore the national context for parents' use of NTH child care, with attention to variation by timing, setting, child age, race, ethnicity, and family income. A framework and review on NTH child care quality will address questions about practices that are most important to families, children, and providers, including cultural practices valued by families and providers. Qualitative analysis of parents' perspectives on NTH child care will further answer questions about parental preferences. We will conclude with a discussion of the implications of these findings for policy and practice across the range of child care policies and systems, as well as future research directions.</p>	<p>Presenters</p> <p>Juliet Bromer, Erikson Institute Sarah Jiyeon Kwon, University of Chicago Diane Schilder, Urban Institute Gina Adams, Urban Institute</p> <p>Scribe</p> <p>Katie Caldwell</p> <p>Number of Attendees: 32</p>
--	---

2. Documents/Presentations Shared (Please list any electronic documents, PowerPoint presentations, or web links used during the session.) *Collect presenter PowerPoints or other documents on the flash drive provided.*

CCEEPRC NTH Intro slides G Adams 6-28-23v2

Urban-Schilder_NTH_Powerpoint_CCEEPRC_F1

3. Brief Summary of Presentations

- **Summary of Presentation #1: Gina Adams, *Unpacking Parent Demand and Quality Priorities for Nontraditional Hour Child Care: Fostering Economic and Cultural Equity*,**
 - Context
 - No consensus on the definition of “nontraditional hour care (NTH)”
 - How do you determine who needs it? One parent, both parents working same hours, etc.
 - Variations in whether the term implicitly or explicitly includes irregular schedules

- Understanding potential demand-work done by Urban Institute researchers:
 - NTH work is common across the US
 - 1 out of 3 children in the US
 - Most common for families who face structural barriers to opportunities
 - Parental work schedules do not tidily into traditional or nontraditional schedules, can have work hours cut across categories
 - NTH hours are not homogenous in terms of child and family needs, preferences
- **Summary of Presentation #2: Sarah Jiyeon Kwon, *Parents Use of NTH Care to Support Employment: Findings from NSECE 2019***
 - Findings from NSECE 2019 study (National Survey of Early Care and Education, 2019 data)
 - This research builds upon previous studies to enhance understanding of the demand and use of child care during parental nonstandard working hours
 - Children from the poorest households are spending the largest amount of time in nonparental care during nontraditional hours
 - The poorest children are spending the most time in unpaid individual providers and the least amount of time in center-based care
 - The most common type of care used is an unpaid individual provider and weekday early mornings shows an increase in center-based care (5am-8am)
 - Weekend center-based care also increases
 - Next steps for future exploration:
 - Heterogeneity by family structure
 - NTH care for school-aged children
 - Multivariate analysis to analyze factors associated with the use of nonparental child care during NTH
 - A significant portion of children are found to have no reported nonparental child care during NTH while their parents are working. Explore who these children are and what that means for future research.
- **Summary of Presentation #3: Diane Schilder, *Nontraditional Hour Child Care: Perspectives from Parents, Providers, Policymakers, and Employers in the Context of National Findings***
 - Very high percentage of families need some type of nontraditional hour care
 - Urban institute studies:
 - Looking at hours between 6pm and 6am
 - Looked at 4 diverse communities: DC, rural Oklahoma, New Haven Connecticut, Austin, Texas
 - Many families used a combo of care (traditional and nontraditional hours)
 - Most relied on family, friends and neighbors
 - Heard from parents about the need for safe, uninterrupted sleep
 - Caregiver trust, safety was highly valued
 - Heard from community leaders that this is a need. Looking into how employers can help:
 - Partnering with child care providers and supporting shared services alliances
 - Creating work schedules
- **Summary of Presentation #4: Juliet Bromer, *Understanding Unique Features of Quality in NTH Child Care: A Cross-Cultural Perspective***
 - Four year nontraditional hour child care study in Illinois
 - Conceptual framework for quality in NTH child care
 - Based on descriptive research
 - Findings from literature review about what helps define quality: Looked at small body of international literature on NTH child care and looked at literature on family routines and rituals across cultural/ethnic groups in the US
 - Culturally sustaining routines and rituals for children
 - Daily routines such as meals, bedtime, overnight, mornings, doing hair, are important contexts for children's development and school readiness

- Broad components (a few below)
 - Transmission of cultural values and identity
 - Unhurried time for play and relaxation
 - Teachable moments Responsive arrangements for families
 - Family-provider connections
 - Trust and reliability for families
 - Logistical considerations
 - Stability
 - Healthy and Equitable working conditions for providers (providers are also nontraditional hour workers)
 - Stress reduction
 - Family-work balance
 - Stability and compensation
 - Professional development and peer support
 - NTH child care settings are critical contexts for child development, not just custodial time
- **Summary of Presentation #5: Gina Adams (discussant), *Implications for NTH-Related Policy, Practice, and Research***
 - Implicit bias in this area – most of our policies, practices, and research tend to make one or more of the following three erroneous assumptions. Specifically:
 - Parents are working traditional hours
 - Define quality the same as child care during traditional hours (for example, not considering the child sleeping in their own bed with their stuffies)
 - Only thinking about licensed care when most parents reported preferring someone to come to their home or have their child sleep at a trusted person’ home
 - Need to consciously think about this implicit bias as we think about policies and practices and speak with families
 - CCDF- subsidies not available for license-exempt home-based providers. Very hard to get it for NTH
 - Establishing appropriate payments hard, as there isn’t really a clear “market” to assess appropriate rates (many do this for free, bartering or other arrangements)
 - We need to think about what kids need during these hours, we can’t use standards made for traditional hour care
 - Differential rates do not seem like a viable option for incentivizing supply (what if only one child needs an extra hour of care- is a slightly higher rate for a single child going to justify keeping a teacher longer?)
 - Address the fundamental lack of information on home-based care

4. Brief Summary of Discussion

- Q: Are there policy barriers to a family having a voucher for traditional hour care but not for NTH?
- A: Diane- the state policy contexts were different for the four locations. One location the licensing prohibited 24 hour care. The grey area seems to be the issue. Many agencies are not willing to step outside the “black and white” of the policy.
- Q: Do you have any states in mind that are doing this well yet? Any thoughts about work arounds?
- A: In Austin, they are piloting some initiatives- supporting shared service alliances and working with employers to better accommodate the need for nontraditional hour care. Oklahoma was offering background checks and off setting the costs for essential workers. Many parents were not willing to apply for this as the same agency that oversaw CPS offered this service.
- A: Found recommendations and case studies- some international (Canada). Home based child care networks might be used for NTC. Possibly going to a “sitter city” type platform- what can be learned from that? Is this equipping the existing workforce or is it a whole new set of workers we should train for this. Anecdotally some older women were interested in only doing overnight care as it is less strenuous.

5. Summary of Key issues raised (facilitators are encouraged to spend the last 3-5 minutes of sessions summarizing the key issues raised during the session; bullets below are prompts for capturing the kinds of issues we're looking for)

- Researchers need to examine issues and biases that exist that transfer from the “traditional” hour care to “nontraditional hour care”. Even down to the term “nontraditional hour care”- in some communities these hours are the “traditional” time parents need care for their children. Assuming all parents work the same schedule all the time or NTH only refers to overnight care is detrimental to the study of NTH care.
- Some communities are exploring the possibility of creating shared service alliances to try to better address the new for NTH care. Another approach has been to work with employers to try and address some of the issues making NTH care a challenge for all involved.
- For NTH care, especially overnight/late night care, parents prefer having their children in their own beds or at a trusted caregiver’s home rather than a center or licensed facility. This is an example of how quality for NTH may be conceptualized differently than traditional hour care.