

E1: Looking at Quality Through a Different Lens: Variations in the Conceptualization of Quality

Thursday, June 29, 2023

1:45 p.m. – 3:00 p.m. | *L'Enfant Ballroom ABCD (Livestreamed)*

1. Descriptive Information

E1: Looking at Quality Through a Different Lens: Variations in the Conceptualization of Quality

The purpose of this session will be to discuss the importance of viewing equity as a key component of child care and early education quality and discuss how to think about quality across the age and ability, diverse developmental needs, varied ways of knowing and being (including language, economic, racial, ethnic, and cultural differences), and environments that are not center-based. For example, little attention has been given in the field to providing quality home-based child care—a setting that often includes children from marginalized groups, care for the majority of infants and toddlers, and children with disabilities (diverse developmental needs). This session will consider how to authentically capture the aspects of the adult–child relationships and interactions that are the most important to consider for these diverse children. Presentations will address the following topics: quality from a racial equity lens, supporting responsive caregiving in infant-toddler settings in ways that honor diversity, quality for home-based child care, and quality for dual language learners and other diverse developmental needs. This session will conclude with a discussion of how these various aspects of quality complement each other and how they should be conceived of holistically.

Presenters

Stephanie Curenton, Boston University

Elizabeth Cavadel, Mathematica

Juliet Bromer, Erikson Institute

Sally Atkins-Burnett, Mathematica

Scribe

Katie Caldwell

Number of Attendees: 50

2. Documents/Presentations Shared (Please list any electronic documents, PowerPoint presentations, or web links used during the session.) *Collect presenter PowerPoints or other documents on the flash drive provided.*

- Looking at Quality Through a Different Lens: Variations in the Conceptualization of Quality
- We Grow Together Professional Development System: Quality through responsive caregiving for infants and toddlers
- Quality in Home-Based Child Care: A Conceptual Framework
- Lessons from the Language Interaction Snapshot (LISn)

3. Brief Summary of Presentations

- **Summary of Presentation #1: Stephanie Curenton - Looking at Quality Through a Different Lens: Variations in the Conceptualization of Quality**
 - Centering racial equity in quality: an ecosystem approach
 - Children of color do not experience the same quality of care and education.
 - Assessing Classroom Sociocultural Equity Scale (ACSEC) (pronounced “access”) 6 dimensions:
 - Challenges status quo knowledge
 - Equitable learning opportunities for RMLs
 - (In)equitable discipline
 - Connection to home life
 - Personalized learning opportunities

- Racially Marginalized Learner's (RML) participation and engagement
 - Research findings
 - ACSES has concurrent validity with CLASS
 - Dimensions of ACSES are associated with specific learning activities in PreK-3 classrooms like free-choice, math, literacy
 - ACSES is associated with preschooler's math and executive functioning skills
 - ACSES is associated with elementary schoolers' math skills, particularly Black students'
 - ACSES is associated with higher academic scores for elementary students, even after controlling for CLASS scores
 - Both elementary and preschool teachers showed more ACSES teaching behaviors when their classrooms were more diverse
 - **ALL** elementary teachers demonstrated the ACSES teaching behaviors
 - ACSES was created to INVEST in the skills and capacity of the ECE workforce and children we serve
 - A professional development system should be rolled out with this tool so that the teacher feels self-reflective, not judged when reviewing ACSES scores.
- **Summary of Presentation #2: Elizabeth Cavadel - We Grow Together Professional Development System: Quality through responsive caregiving for infants and toddlers**
 - We Grow Together- professional development system to support quality
 - Importance of quality measures and professional development for infant-toddler caregivers
 - More than 50% of infants and toddlers receive non-parental caregivers
 - These caregivers often have less access to professional development
 - Q-CCIIT (Quality of Care for Infants and Toddlers)
 - Measures quality of interactions between caregivers and infants/toddlers. Responsiveness
 - We Grow Together (WGT)
 - Used in center-based care and family child care homes
 - Professional Development (PD) providers to support caregivers too
 - Practice self-awareness
 - Accept differences in caregiving practices
 - Facilitate connections with families
 - We recommend including cultural considerations more explicitly in caregiver materials, not just the Professional Development provider materials.
 - WGT 2018-2019 field test findings:
 - Positive change in interactions with children
 - Teachers felt the PD providers were supportive
 - Caregivers reported WGT benefited children in their care
- **Summary of Presentation #3: Juliet Bromer - Quality in Home-Based Child Care: A Conceptual Framework**
 - Conceptual framework for quality in home based care
 - Based on work from the Home-based Child Care Supply and Quality (HBCCSQ) project
 - Framework was developed from a literature review of CCEE research on home-based child care
 - Uses a strengths-based approach and an equity lens
 - Features that may look different in home-based child care (HBCC)
 - Safe and healthy home environment
 - Predictable routines
 - Opportunities for informal learning
 - Opportunities for interactions with community and community resources
 - Culturally and linguistically grounded provider child interactions
 - Support continuity of care
 - Positive peer interactions within a mixed age group
 - Family Supports and supportive provider-family relationship
 - Cultural responsiveness to and connectedness to families
 - Healthy working conditions and resources for sustaining HBCC

- Social connectedness
 - Future research
 - Working on measure development
 - Understand how these features may influence, support, or directly contribute to outcomes for children and families
 - Understand if and how HBCC quality features may buffer inequities faced by children and families from communities of color who may experience multiple forms of marginalization (e.g., racial and economic inequities)
 - Consider how quality improvement initiatives and rating standards can better reflect and support HBCC
 - Discussion Questions
 - How might CCEE initiatives take into account HBCC providers' sources of knowledge and strengths in nurturing children's development and growth throughout the day?
 - What strategies could initiatives use to support providers who care for mixed-age groups of children?
 - How do initiatives recognize and support providers' strengths and assets as well as their culturally and linguistically sustaining interactions with children?
 - How can programs help providers develop supportive relationships with families of children in care?
 - What strategies could help providers balance flexible schedules and payments, as well as nonchild-care tasks, while also attending to their own physical, psychological, and emotional well-being?
- **Summary of Presentation #4: Sally Atkins-Burnett - Lessons from the Language Interaction Snapshot (LISn)**
 - Language Interaction Snapshot (LISn)
 - Designed to measure similarities and differences in language interactions.
 - Purpose: assess the type and quality of language interactions in early childhood setting serving dual language learners (DLLs)
 - Approach: observed time samples (5 min. snapshots) of an individual child's language experience
 - 3 or 4 children selected for observation in a classroom
 - Observers cycle through selected children until each child has six 5-minute snapshots
 - Observers code type of talk and language used with the child in each 30-second cycle
 - Describe the context(s) for the interactions including the number of conversations
 - Findings:
 - Patterns in language and use of categories of talk similar across studies
 - Most adult talk was in English - even with Spanish monolingual children
 - Adults most often used low level language strategies
 - Variation in teacher talk is found across children with different characteristics—signaling differences in children's' learning experiences
 - Most conversations occur with peers and usually in English
 - Limited teacher support was observed for peer-to-peer talk
 - Implications:
 - Measures of quality that follow individual children identify differences in children's experiences and provide information about how to address inequities.
 - PD providers should increase teacher's awareness of the benefits of decontextualized talk (reasoning, story-telling, personal narratives)
 - Teachers would benefit from understanding of methods to build on using peer interactions to support stronger language skills.
 - Teachers should increase frequency of conversations, read and talk about books with children, conduct small group experiences, arrange activities that encourage peer talk
- **Summary of Presentation #5: Amanda Coleman (discussant)**
 - Key theme: focus on equity is critical to our conversations of ECE quality.
 - ACSES highlights practices that are essential to promoting equity

- We have relied on measures that tells us the average child's experience and while that has its place, the LISn shows the value of seeing the experience of individual children.
- Importance of linking measures with professional development tools (like We Grow Together) and quality improvement

4. Brief Summary of Discussion

- Q: Importance of pairing your measure with a PD system- are you working to do that?
- A: At the SEED center, we are working on that on our own and are open to doing it with a state or other larger entity in the future.
- Q: Sally- sample size and how generalizable is this? Other languages?
- A: Languages- in LA we were largely looking at Spanish, have b used Cantonese in San Francisco with. Most studies had about 70 classrooms.
- Q: How do you see this research working in tandem to move this body of work forward?
- A: Conceptual framework is broad and meant to inform ideas of quality- inform new development of measures and PD.
- Q: Do you worry about unintended consequences in underserved populations?
- A: Sally: I do worry about this. I don't think the LISn is something a state would pick up because it's such a research based tool and made to inform professional development.
Stephanie: That was really hard for me as well. I always talk about the measure the way it's intended to be used and had to come to terms that I couldn't control it's use once it was released into the world.
- Q: What did the role of parent voice in the development of your tools?
- A: LISn- did not have a strong parent voice for that because we were drawing on research, HBCC- we have practice experts. Conceptual framework is based on literature review- much of the literature was based on parent view.

5. Summary of Key issues raised (facilitators are encouraged to spend the last 3-5 minutes of sessions summarizing the key issues raised during the session; bullets below are prompts for capturing the kinds of issues we're looking for)

- The ACSES tool is a new tool available to use to measure racial equity and quality in ECE settings. It should be used in tandem with a professional development system to support teachers as they review their ACSES scores and reflect on their teaching practices.
- An equity focus is critical to our ECE research around defining and evaluating quality.
- To implement higher levels of equity and quality, it is important to pair efforts with a Professional Development system to best support providers.